

5 Consideration of Alternatives

Under section 171(b) of the Resource Management Act 1991 an assessment of alternative sites, routes or methods is required if the requiring authority:

- Does not have an interest in the land sufficient for undertaking the work; OR
- It is likely the work will have a significant adverse effect on the environment.

Auckland City Council owns all sites subject to this designation. In addition the effects on the environment are assessed as no more than minor (as discussed in section 6 of this report). Accordingly, an alternatives assessment is not required for this NoR. However, details of alternatives considered have been included in this report to provide both the relevant background to the project and for the sake of completeness.

5.1 Alternative Sites

As discussed in section 3 of this report Council undertook a two-stage community consultation process in late 2006 to assist with the selection of an appropriate site and development option for the proposed library and service centre on Waiheke Island.

The aim of the stage 1 consultation was to broadly canvass the community's views and needs on a range of issues relating to the library, service centre and Artworks site. The second stage of the consultation process involved consultation on three detailed development and location options which were determined as a result of the stage 1 consultation. These options included:

- Option 1: Library in Oneroa on Church land and the service centre in Ostend;
- Option 2: Combined Library and service centre in Oneroa on the Church site; and
- Option 3: Combined Library and service centre facility in Ostend.

These options were assessed by Council and an initial decision was made in September 2007 to locate the library at Oneroa and the service centre facility was to remain in Ostend.

Due to budget constraints which arose in late 2008, the Council undertook a review of all project budgets in its Long Term Council Community Plan. As a result of that review the original budget set aside for this project was reduced. Upon review the size requirements for both the new library and service centre in relation to the new budgets it was determined that the reduced budget would provide inadequate standalone buildings in terms of their size and efficient operation. Rather, a combined building facility would enable the sharing of staff facilities and plant rooms to assist in reducing the overall size of the building and provide a cost efficient option which meets the operational requirements of both facilities.

Although a move to construct a combined facility was noted as contrary to the findings of community consultation. Given the period of economic constraint the Council felt that the community may prefer new combined facilities to no or limited development.

As a result of the above context, it was resolved by the Auckland City Council Community Services Committee in October 2009 that the preferred approach is to develop a combined Waiheke library and service centre facility on Auckland City Council land adjacent to the Artworks site at Oneroa.

5.2 Alternative Methods

Designating the site is considered to be the most appropriate means to provide for new multi purpose community facilities for the following reasons:

The TIA concludes that the adverse effects associated with the operation and safety of the proposed vehicle accesses, the existing Korora Road / Ocean View Road intersection as a result of the predicted additional traffic generation on the environment will be no more than minor.

6.5.2 Vehicle Access

a. Access off Korora Road

The two vehicle accesses off Korora Road are to be predominantly for visitors to the site to ensure that parking on the site is not taken up by staff. Both of these accesses utilise existing vehicle crossovers.

The TIA concludes that, given the location of these accesses on a local road it is anticipated that these access arrangements will be able to operate safely and efficiently and that the predicted additional vehicle trips will have no significant adverse effects on the safe operation of the existing Korora Road / Ocean View Road intersection.

b. Access of Ocean View Road

The TIA concludes that the associated number of vehicle movements at this access will have no more than minor effects on the safe and efficient operation of Ocean View Road.

The TIA recommends improvements to the visibility from the Ocean View Road site access in the form of a safe intersection sight distance of 80m measured along the road carriageway centreline between vehicles on the site access and vehicles travelling along Ocean View Road. This will require removal/re-grading of the existing retaining structure at the site.

6.5.3 Parking and Loading

The car parking survey identified that there was typically car parking available on the site and on the surrounding road network throughout the day. The TIA assesses that the anticipated additional car parking demand associated with the proposed designation of the site to be 33 car parks.

It has been demonstrated that there is existing availability of off-site car parking to satisfactorily accommodate the predicted additional off-site car parking demand. However, it is recognised that the majority of the additional parking demand, 23 of the 33 additional car parks are associated with service centre staff.

In order to prioritise visitor demand for car parking both on-site and in close proximity to the site, the following car parking strategy is recommended:

- Provision of a maximum of 34 car parks on-site, including three disabled car parks;
- Maximum provision of 12 staff car parks within the proposed on-site car parks to provide for staff parking demand associated with all on-site community facilities, as well as delivery/service vehicles. Staff car parks would not be time restricted;
- Remaining on-site car parks to be time restricted. It is suggested that the time restriction be not more than 180 minutes and be applicable on weekdays, potentially 08:00 to 18:00. It is considered that this would prioritise use of these on-site car parks for visitors to the community uses on the site;
- Four new on-street car parks in the existing bus layby on the northern side of Ocean View Road to be subject to a maximum time restriction of 15 minutes to facilitate use for short duration trips by visitors to the community uses; and
- Time restrictions to be implemented on the existing on-street car parks on Korora Road and Ocean View Road (to the west of Korora Road) to prioritise use of these on-site car parks by

visitors to the community uses on the site. It is suggested that the time restriction be not more than 120 minutes and be applicable on weekdays, potentially 08:00 to 18:00.

A designation condition is proposed regarding further monitoring of the on-site car parking area (refer to section 9 of this report). Should the car parking surveys identify unanticipated adverse traffic effects associated with the new activities, there is sufficient land within the designation to provide additional on-site car parking in the northern part of the site (4 Korora Road, currently occupied by a residential dwelling).

The TIA concludes that the car parking strategy and associated monitoring condition can satisfactorily mitigate the anticipated adverse effects associated with the predicted car parking demand of the community activities identified in the proposed designation.

6.5.4 Loading Provision

It is intended that the majority of deliveries and servicing for the new library/service centre building would be undertaken from the car park at the end of the accessway off Ocean View Road. A turning area will be provided in this area to satisfactorily accommodate the manoeuvres of the anticipated service and delivery vehicles. It is considered that these arrangements will provide satisfactory loading provision for the site.

6.5.5 Pedestrians, Cyclists and Passenger Transport

Pedestrian accessibility to both the existing and new buildings off Ocean View Road will be improved through the provision of several access routes for pedestrians from both east and west.

In the vicinity of the entrance to the new library/service centre provision it is proposed to provide cycle parks for visitors. The number of these parks will be provided through the Outline Plan process.

It is not anticipated that the predicted additional traffic generation associated with the proposed designation will have a significant adverse effect on the operation of existing bus services along Ocean View Road or Korora Road.

6.5.6 Cultural, Heritage and Archaeological Effects

There are no items of cultural, heritage or archaeological significance included within the relevant Operative and Proposed ACDP:HGI Planning Maps for the subject site. In addition, it is also noted that the site is highly modified given the existing development and apparent earthworked areas.

Accordingly, it is not considered that the proposed designation will create adverse effects in relation to culture, heritage and archaeology. Notwithstanding this, a condition relating to Accidental Discovery Protocol is proposed as part of this NoR in the event that any items of potential significance in relation to these matters are discovered on site.

6.5.7 Infrastructure Effects

Auckland City Council has confirmed that telecommunications, reticulated water and power services are currently available to the site. The site will be connected to the Waiheke stormwater and wastewater reticulation systems.

- The designation will allow Auckland City Council to undertake the project or work in accordance with the designation;
- The designation will allow land required for the project to be identified in the District Plan, to give a clear indication to the community and other infrastructure providers for the intended use of the land;
- The designation enables the project or work to be undertaken in a comprehensive and integrated manner;
- Designation provides land use certainty for essential future community infrastructure; and
- The designation provides flexibility in the overall development of the site in terms of the design of the community facilities.

Alternative methods to designating the site for community facilities would be for Auckland City Council to apply for resource consent or undertake a plan change (which is essentially what effect this designation will have at the site). Section 2.3.3 of this report provides a discussion around the rationale for designating and this is also applicable to why the designation process has been chosen as the appropriate planning mechanism in this instance.

6 Assessment of Environmental Effects

The actual and potential effects on the environment resulting from the proposed designation relate to the following:

- Social/Community effects;
- Character effects;
- Visual Amenity Effects;
- Noise Effects;
- Traffic effects;
- Cultural/Heritage effects;
- Infrastructure effects; and
- Construction effects.

Each of the effects above is discussed separately below and mitigation measures are proposed where appropriate.

6.1 Social/Community Effects

Designating this land for multi purpose community facilities is considered to have the following positive social/community effects:

- It protects land for the establishment of key community infrastructure to enable the community to provide for their well being;
- Establishing a site that allows for existing and future community facilities which has the potential to become a focal point for the Waiheke community;
- The community facility site is strategically located in close proximity to Oneroa Town Centre and therefore is accessible to a range of users;
- The redeveloped site will act as a 'gateway' to Oneroa Village with architecturally designed buildings;
- The integrated service centre/library development will enable improved service delivery as floor space for both the activities will be significantly increased in comparison to the existing buildings which house these activities;
- The site will result in the consolidation of the library and service centre activities which will enable the community to visit both activities at one location;
- Provides an opportunity to create a sustainably developed, integrated site to provide for community facilities which will reflect the culture and aspirations of the Waiheke Island community; and
- The development of this site for the purpose of a new library and service centre, in addition to further community facilities in the future is the first stage in creating what is envisaged to become the heart of the Oneroa Community.

As a result of the above discussion it is concluded that the proposed designation for community facilities will have positive and beneficial social and community effects on the wider Waiheke Island community.

6.2 Character Effects

Site development for proposed community facilities has the potential to alter the character within the local and wider environment due to the change in some activities from residential to commercial,

which will result in increased site activity, differing building bulk and location and increased traffic movements.

The Artworks site (at 127, 129 Ocean View Road and 2 Korora Road) contains existing community facilities that will be similar to those anticipated on the subject site once it is developed. A number of these existing community facilities will be retained at the site and integrated with new community facilities in the future. The anticipated character effects of the new community facility activities are considered to be similar to those generated from the existing community facility.

The subject sites located at 131 and 133 Ocean View Road currently contain a Church and Residential dwelling respectively and it is anticipated these land uses may be altered under the designation. A Church is classified as a community facility under the ACDP: HGI therefore the proposal to develop another community facility activity such as a library or service centre at this location is not considered to be a significant change in terms of activity and resulting character effects. The ability to change from a residential activity to community facility at the site located at 133 Ocean View Road has the potential to alter the character of the local environment as there will be an increase in the anticipated traffic movements to this site, as well as the ability to establish larger buildings than the existing residential dwelling. [Given the location of the site fronting Ocean View Road (a primary road) and the indication in the ACDP:HGI (decision version 2009) that the site is to provide for community facilities as permitted activities in the future, the proposed use and resulting character is considered to be appropriate at this site in line with what is intended.]

In addition, site development will be controlled by the *Community Facility* definition (which is outlined in section 2 for the purposes of this designation). As previously discussed, community facilities are permitted activities in the commercial zone therefore their resulting effects can be anticipated at this location. As part of the plan review process (described in section 2 of this report) it has been demonstrated that the effects of this activity will be consistent with the context of the surrounding environment, therefore this activity will be appropriate for the anticipated character of the area. This expected character is also supported by the rezoning of both the eastern adjoining site and the remaining Ocean View Road properties to commercial which will connect with Oneroa Township. In addition, the site will also connect with the existing commercial and retail activities opposite the site on Ocean View Road.

Overall, land for community facilities is considered to be appropriate in this location due to the close proximity to Oneroa Township, the existing cluster of commercial and retail activity opposite the site on Ocean View Road, and the direction in the Proposed Plan for rezoning of the site and adjoining land for commercial purposes.

6.3 Visual Effects

The proposal has the potential to generate adverse visual effects on both the local and wider environment as a result of the built form of any community facilities established on site. Residential properties are located both to the north (6 Korora Road), east of the subject site (135 Ocean View Road), opposite the site at Korora Road, and to the north of the site off Waikare Road. These properties could be potentially adversely affected in terms of dominance by any future buildings on-site. Discussion regarding these effects is provided below.

The residential zoned properties of 3, 5, 7 and 9 Korora Road have an outlook to the subject site, in particular 2 and 4 Korora Road and 127 Ocean View Road which form part of the existing Artwork's facility (4 Korora Road currently provides for informal car parking for the Artwork's site). As part of the designation the overall activity that is currently occurring on site will not be altered, however it will provide for future development of further community facilities if required. As such, the effects generated from the activities will be similar to those currently operating on-site. Notwithstanding this, any on-site development will be established in accordance with development controls that form

part of this designation. As discussed, these controls are based on the underlying proposed Commercial 1 zone development controls and will minimise any potential adverse effects because these controls have been determined to appropriately protect the visual qualities of the location (see section 9 of this report for the proposed designation conditions/development controls). For example, building height will be restricted to 8m (permitted activity). This will minimise visual effects with respect to building bulk on these opposite properties. Landscaping will also be provided on the site to provide a visual buffer for buildings.

The property located at 6 Korora Road is separated from the subject site with permeable fencing and mature vegetation. At this stage, it is proposed to formalise the existing informal parking area located onsite adjacent to this property by way of sealing and marking the car park. However, if the site is to be developed with buildings in the future these will be established in accordance with the development controls imposed as conditions on this designation. Notwithstanding this discussion, community facilities are classified as permitted activity within the commercial zone, and this will be applicable as the underlying zone for the area covered by the designation if confirmed when the ACDP:HGI becomes operative. As discussed, the permitted activities provided for in the commercial zoning for these sites have been tested in terms of their anticipated effects on the surrounding environment. The inclusion of this zoning at the subject site within the ACDP: HGI (Decision version 2009) demonstrates that adverse visual effects as a result of commercial development at these sites (in accordance with the relevant rules) have been considered to be appropriate in the context of the local environment.

The properties to the north of the subject site are located below a ridgeline. The dwellings on these sites are situated on the downwards slope from this ridge and are orientated to overlook Oneroa Bay. The outlook from these dwellings towards the subject site is considered to be restricted by the presence of the abovementioned ridge and therefore any views to the site will be oblique. It is considered that the development potential at the top of this ridge is also limited. In order to mitigate any potential effects on the adjoining site it is proposed to provide a 1.5m planted setback along this boundary. This is in addition to adhering to development controls that form part of this designation. It is noted that these properties to the north will likely remain zoned for residential purposes under the ACDP: HGI (Proposed 2006 and Decision version 2009).

The adjoining property to the east of the subject site, located at 135 Ocean View Road is zoned commercial under the both ACDP: HGI (Proposed 2006) and ACDP: HGI (Decision version 2009). Accordingly, similar commercial activities are anticipated at this site in the future. Currently there is a residential dwelling at this location, however given this change in zoning it is considered appropriate to assess the effects of the proposed designation on both this residential activity and the likely future commercial zoning. The outlook from this property could potentially be affected by the larger footprint that could be anticipated by a community building(s) (when compared with the existing residential dwelling that it currently adjoins). If this eastern portion of the site is developed with buildings in the future these buildings will be established in accordance with the development controls that form part of this designation including, a 1.5m planted setback from adjoining properties and compliance with the height in relation to boundary rules. Notwithstanding this, the rezoning of this site for commercial activities was proposed as part of the ACDP:HGI Operative 1996 plan review and as part of this, analysis would have been undertaken to determine the appropriateness of this rezoning and an assessment provided in the section 32 report. It is therefore understood that as part of this rezoning assessment it will have been determined that the visual effects will be no more than minor on the local environment, given compliance with zone rules.

With regard to visual effects on the wider environment, Auckland City Council's aspirations are to construct buildings that will have a positive visual impact on the Oneroa urban area. It is expected that any buildings will be architecturally designed and peer reviewed by the Auckland City Council Urban Design Panel. Any building will be in accordance with the development controls that form

part of this designation. Maintaining and incorporating additional landscaping at the site will also provide visual relief to built form.

By establishing buildings along Ocean View Road primarily in accordance with the conditions proposed on this designation will minimise adverse visual affects on the wider environment, while the landscaped areas will provide appropriate buffer areas between surrounding residential properties.

In light of this discussion it is considered that the visual effects of future built form can be appropriately managed through conditions relating to building height, yard requirements and through landscaping (which will be detailed in the Outline Plan). Further consideration of the height shape and bulk of new buildings on the land to be designated will be undertaken at the Outline Plan stage (within the parameters of the conditions set in section 9).

6.4 Noise

It is anticipated that the majority of the community facilities will generally operate during day time hours of 8am through to 5pm, Monday to Saturday, consistent with the neighbouring commercial activities within the Oneroa Township.

It is appropriate to impose the proposed underlying commercial zone noise controls on this designation as this is the baseline that will be established by the District Plan once it becomes operative (as discussed previously in this report and refer to section 9). This will allow the proposed community facilities to operate in accordance with these controls. This district plan zoning sets up expectations of greater noise in terms of traffic, people and site intensity and is appropriate to be imposed for this designation.

As such, it is not envisaged that the proposed activities will result in noise levels that are objectionable beyond the site boundary or which create significant adverse effects in the adjoining living environments.

6.5 Traffic Effects

A specialist Traffic Impact Assessment (TIA) has been undertaken by Beca which assesses the actual and potential traffic effects as a result of the proposed designation. This report is included in Appendix C to this report and is discussed in the following sections.

As it is anticipated that a new library and service centre will be the first to be developed under the designation, the TIA report uses these as a basis for assessing the actual and potential effects. As such the preliminary master planning undertaken with regards to this is included as an appendix to the traffic report.

6.5.1 Traffic Generation

The new facilities are expected to generate an additional 10% increase in visitor demand for the library on the site as set out in the TIA. The TIA assesses that designating the site to provide for a new library/service centre building could potentially generate approximately 50 additional vehicle trips in a one hour period on the surrounding road network. However, throughout the majority of the day and during the typical surrounding road network peak periods, it is anticipated that the additional traffic generation would be lower. In addition, these trips are unlikely to be 'new' trips on the surrounding road network. Some trips may be extensions of trips already being undertaken to Oneroa, where vehicles park in the town centre, and may now include a visit to the library/service centre. Other trips may be an existing trip associated with the Matiatia ferry terminal, as visitors are passing-by.